USDC SCAN INDEX SHEET

















GEP 1/3/05 9:50

3:04-CV-02591 HUBBARD V. GUPTA

1

CMP.

ORIGINAL

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

LYNN HUBBARD, III, SBN 69773
SCOTTLYNN J HUBBARD, IV, SBN 212970
LAW OFFICES OF LYNN HUBBARD
12 WILLIAMSBURG LANE
CHICO, CA. 95926
(530) 895-3252

Attorney for Plaintiff

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

LYNN J HUBBARD and BARBARA J. HUBBARD

Plaintiff,

vs.

ROSHAN L. GUPTA and SHEELA GUPTA dba GAS DEPOT STATION.

Defendants,

'04 CV 2591 No.



DEPUTY

Plaintiff's Complaint

> Hubbard v. Gas Depot Station, et al., Plaintiff's Complaint



Page 2

Plaintiff's Complaint

IV. PARTIES

- 7. Gas Depot Station owns, operates, or leases the Gas Station, and consists of a person (or persons), firm, or corporation.
- 8. The Hubbards have multiple conditions that affect one or more major life functions. The Hubbards require the use of motorized wheelchairs and a mobility-equipped vehicle, when traveling about in public. Consequently, the Hubbards are "physically disabled," as defined by all applicable California and United States laws, and a member of the public whose rights are protected by these laws.

V. FACTS

- 9. The Gas Station is a service establishment, open to the public, which is intended for nonresidential use and whose operation affects commerce.
- 10. The Hubbards visited the Gas Station and encountered barriers (both physical and intangible) that interfered with—if not outright denied—their ability to use and enjoy the goods, services, privileges, and accommodations offered at the facility. To the extent known by the Hubbards, attached as Exhibit A to this complaint is a true and accurate list (with photos) of barriers that denied them access at the Gas Station.
- 11. Notwithstanding that visit, the Hubbards were also deterred from visiting the Gas Station, because they knew that the Gas Station's goods, services, facilities, privileges, advantages, and accommodations at the Gas Station were unavailable to physically disabled patrons (such as themselves). They still refuse to visit the Gas Station because of the future threats of injury created by these barriers.
- 12. The Hubbards also encountered barriers at the Gas Station, which violate state and federal law, but were unrelated to their disability; these unrelated barriers were included within Exhibit A, as a courtesy to

Hubbard v. Gas Depot Station, et al., Plaintiff's Complaint

Gas Depot Station, so the defendants can avoid inadvertent acts of discrimination against the disabled. Nothing within this complaint, however, should be construed as an allegation that the Hubbards are seeking to remove barriers unrelated to their disabilities.

- Gas Station were inaccessible, violate state and federal law, and interfere with (or deny) access to the physically disabled. Moreover, defendants have the financial resources to remove these barriers from the Gas Station (without much difficulty or expense), and make the facility accessible to the physically disabled. To date, however, they refuse to either remove those barriers or seek an unreasonable hardship exemption to excuse their noncompliance.
- 14. The Hubbards have suffered (or anticipates suffering) emotional and physical harm during each visit to the Gas Station and each incident of deterrence. Moreover, because of Gas Depot Station 's acts and omissions, they suffered physical discomfort and injury, emotional distress, and mental suffering and distress.
- 15. All injuries suffered by the Hubbards are expectedly and naturally associated with Gas Depot Station 's acts and omissions at the Gas Station.

VI. FIRST CLAIM

Americans with Disabilities Act of 1990

Denial of "Full and Equal" Enjoyment and Use

- 16. The Hubbards incorporate the allegations contained in paragraphs 1 through 15 for this claim.
- 17. Title III of the ADA holds as a 'general rule' that no individual shall be discriminated against on the basis of disability in the full and equal enjoyment (or use) of goods, services, facilities, privileges, and

Hubbard v. Gas Depot Station, et al., Plaintiff's Complaint

accommodations offered by any person who owns, operates, or leases a place of public accommodation. 42 U.S.C. § 12182(a).

18. Gas Depot Station discriminated against the Hubbards by denying "full and equal enjoyment" and use of the goods, services, facilities, privileges or accommodations of the Gas Station during each visit and each incident of deterrence.

Failure to Remove Architectural Barriers in an Existing Facility

- 19. The ADA specifically prohibits failing to remove architectural barriers, which are structural in nature, in existing facilities where such removal is readily achievable. 42 U.S.C. § 12182(b)(2)(A)(iv). The term "readily achievable" is defined as "easily accomplishable and able to be carried out without much difficulty or expense." <u>Id.</u> § 12181(9).
- 20. When an entity can demonstrate that removal of a barrier is not readily achievable, a failure to make goods, services, facilities, or accommodations available through alternative methods is also specifically prohibited if these methods are readily achievable. <u>Id.</u> § 12182(b)(2)(A)(v).
- 21. Here, The Hubbards allege that Gas Depot Station can easily remove the architectural barriers at the Gas Station without much difficulty or expense, and that Gas Depot Station violated the ADA by failing to remove those barriers, when it was readily achievable to do so.
- 22. In the alternative, if it was not "readily achievable" for Gas Depot Station to remove the Gas Station's barriers, then Gas Depot Station violated the ADA by failing to make the required services available through alternative methods, which are readily achievable.

Failure to Design and Construct an Accessible Facility

23. On information and belief, the Gas Station was designed or constructed (or both) after January 26, 1992—independently triggering access requirements under Title III of the ADA.

24. The ADA also prohibits designing and constructing facilities for first occupancy after January 26, 1993, that aren't readily accessible to, and usable by, individuals with disabilities when it was structurally practicable to do so. 42 U.S.C. § 12183(a)(1).

25. Here, Gas Depot Station violated the ADA by designing or constructing (or both) the Gas Station in a manner that was not readily accessible to the physically disabled public—including the Hubbards—when it was structurally practical to do so.

Failure to Make an Altered Facility Accessible

- 26. On information and belief, the Gas Station was modified after January 26, 1992, independently triggering access requirements under the ADA.
- 27. The ADA also requires that facilities altered in a manner that affects (or could affect) its usability must be made readily accessible to individuals with disabilities to the maximum extent feasible. 42 U.S.C. § 12183(a)(2). Altering an area that contains a facility's primary function also requires adding making the paths of travel, bathrooms, telephones, and drinking fountains serving that area accessible to the maximum extent feasible. Id.
- 28. Here, Gas Depot Station altered the Gas Station in a manner that violated the ADA and was not readily accessible to the physically disabled public—including Feezor—to the maximum extent feasible.

Failure to Modify Existing Policies and Procedures

29. The ADA also requires reasonable modifications in policies, practices, or procedures, when necessary to afford such goods, services, facilities, or accommodations to individuals with disabilities, unless the entity can demonstrate that making such modifications would fundamentally alter their nature. 42 U.S.C. § 12182(b)(2)(A)(ii).

Here, Gas Depot Station violated the ADA by failing to make reasonable modifications in policies, practices, or procedures at the Gas Station, when these modifications were necessary to afford (and would not fundamentally alter the nature of) these goods, services, facilities, or

- The Hubbards seek all relief available under the ADA (i.e., injunctive relief, attorney fees, costs, legal expense) for these
- The Hubbards also seek a finding from this Court (i.e., declaratory relief) that Gas Depot Station violated the ADA in order to pursue damages under California's Unruh Civil Rights Act or Disabled
- The Hubbards incorporate the allegations contained in
- California Civil Code § 54 states, in part, that: Individuals with disabilities have the same right as the general public to the full and free use of the streets, sidewalks, walkways, public buildings and facilities, and
- California Civil Code § 54.1 also states, in part, that: Individuals with disabilities shall be entitled to full and equal access to accommodations, facilities, telephone facilities, places of public accommodation, and other places to which the general public is invited.
- Both sections specifically incorporate (by reference) an individual's rights under the ADA. See Civil Code §§ 54(c) and 54.1(d).
- Here, Gas Depot Station discriminated against the physically disabled public—including the Hubbards—by denying them full and equal

access to the Gas Station. Gas Depot Station also violated The Hubbards rights under the ADA, and, therefore, infringed upon or violated (or both) The Hubbards rights under the Disabled Persons Act.

- 38. <u>For each offense</u> of the Disabled Persons Act, The Hubbards seek actual damages (both general and special damages), statutory minimum damages of one thousand dollars (\$1,000), declaratory relief, and any other remedy available under California Civil Code § 54.3.
- 39. He also seeks to enjoin Gas Depot Station from violating the Disabled Persons Act (and ADA) under California Civil Code § 55, and to recover reasonable attorneys' fees and incurred under California Civil Code §§ 54.3 and 55.

VIII. THIRD CLAIM

Unruh Civil Rights Act

- 40. The Hubbards incorporate the allegations contained in paragraphs 1 through 32 for this claim.
- 41. California Civil Code § 51 states, in part, that: All persons within the jurisdiction of this state are entitled to the full and equal accommodations, advantages, facilities, privileges, or services in all business establishments of every kind whatsoever.
- 42. California Civil Code § 51.5 also states, in part, that: No business establishment of any kind whatsoever shall discriminate against any person in this state because of the disability of the person.
- 43. California Civil Code § 51(f) specifically incorporates (by reference) an individual's rights under the ADA into the Unruh Act.
- 44. Gas Depot Station 's aforementioned acts and omissions denied the physically disabled public—including Feezor—full and equal accommodations, advantages, facilities, privileges and services in a business establishment (because of their physical disability).

Hubbard v. Gas Depot Station, et al., Plaintiff's Complaint

- 45. These acts and omissions (including the ones that violate the ADA) denied, aided or incited a denial, or discriminated against the Hubbards by violating the Unruh Act.
- 46. The Hubbards were damaged by Gas Depot Station 's wrongful conduct, and seeks all available relief under Civil Code § 52. This relief includes actual damages and statutory minimum damages of four thousand dollars (\$4,000) for each offense.
- 47. The Hubbards also seek to enjoin Gas Depot Station from violating the Unruh Act (and ADA), and recover reasonable attorneys' fees and costs incurred under California Civil Code § 52(a).

IX. FOURTH CLAIM

Denial of Full and Equal Access to Public Facilities

- 48. The Hubbards incorporate the allegations contained in paragraphs 1 through 15 for this claim.
- 49. Health and Safety Code § 19955(a) states, in part, that: California public accommodations or facilities (built with private funds) shall adhere to the provisions of Government Code § 4450.
- 50. Health and Safety Code § 19959 states, in part, that: Every existing (non-exempt) public accommodation constructed prior to July 1, 1970, which is altered or structurally repaired, is required to comply with this chapter.
- 51. The Hubbards allege the Gas Station is a public accommodation constructed, altered, or repaired in a manner that violates Part 5.5 of the Health and Safety Code or Government Code § 4450 (or both), and that the Gas Station was not exempt under Health and Safety Code § 19956.
- 52. Gas Depot Station 's non-compliance with these requirements at the Gas Station aggrieved (or potentially aggrieved) the Hubbards and

Page 10

Plaintiff's Complaint

1	2. Declaratory relief that Gas Depot Station violated the ADA for the								
2		purposes of Unruh Act or Disabled Persons Act damages.							
3	3.	3. Statutory minimum damages under either sections 52(a) or 54.3(a) of							
4		the California Civil Code (but not both) according to the proof.							
5	4.	General and special damages in the amount of \$100,000.00;							
6	5.	Attorneys' fees, litigation expenses, and costs of suit.							
7	6.	Interest at the legal rate from the date of the filing of this action.							
8	7.	Punitive damages pursuant to Civil Code § 3294.							
9	8. Prejudgment interest pursuant to Civil Code § 3291.								
10	9. Such other and further relief as the court may deem proper.								
11	DAT	ED: December 27, 2004 LAW OFFICES OF LYNN HUBBARD							
12									
13									
14		LYNN HUBBARD, III Attorney for the Hubbards							
15									
16									
17									
18									
19									
20									
21									
22									
23									
24									
25									
26									
27]								
28	1 Thi	s includes attorneys' fees under California Code of Civil Procedure 8 1021.5							

This includes attorneys' fees under California Code of Civil Procedure § 1021.5. <u>Hubbard v. Gas Depot Station, et al.</u>, Plaintiff's Complaint

•

PRELIMINARY SITE ACCESSIBILITY REPORT

Gas Depot Station 199 Broadway Chula Vista, California



GAS DEPOT STATION 199 Broadway Chula Vista, CA

DSA pg 2&3		1. Tow away sign posted at wrong height.			
		SEE PHOTO No. 1			
1129 B Fig 21		2. Tow away sign has no phone number.			
DOT #R100B		3. Tow away sign wrong color.			
		SEE PHOTO No. 2			
1129 B.5	4.6.4	4. Incorrect placement of parking signage. Sign hidden behind vending machine.			
		SEE PHOTO No. 3			
1129 B.4.1	4.6.3	5. Incorrect parking space/access aisle dimensions.			
1129 B.5.1&2	4.6.4	6. Accessible parking space and access aisle not outlined white.			
CVC 21 458(a)(3)	(A)	7. Access aisle not striped in white.			
1129B.4.1 Fig 11 B-18 A		8. Missing no parking painted in accessible aisle.			
		SEE PHOTO No. 4			
1117 B.5 Fig 11 B-6	4.30	9. Entrance door has no ISA.			
		SEE PHOTO No. 4			

border.

10. No exterior route of travel from the property

11. No exterior route of travel from parking.

1127 B.

1127 B.

36.304

4.3.2

1127 B. 3		12. No exterior route of travel signs.					
1117 B.2	4.1.3	13. Public telephone not accessible height.					
1117 B.2.8	4.1.3 (17) (b) 4.31.5 (2)	14. Public telephone has no volume control.					
1117 B. 5.8.3 Fig 11 B14C	4.30.7 Fig 43	15. Public telephone has no ISA.					
	SI	EE PHOTO Nos. 6 and 7					
1122 B. 4	4.30.7	16. This location does not have an accessible check stand.					
1122 B. 4 Fig11B- 5D and F	4.32.3	17. Cashier's counter does not have a section 28 to 34 inches high and 36 inches wide and 24 inches deep maximum to accommodate a wheelchair occupant.					
1102 B 1114 B.1.2	4.3 4.3.3 Fig 7 (a & b)	18. No accessible route through store. At least one aisle is less than 36 inches wide.					
Bus. And Prof. Code	e #13660	19. No emergency call button on pump islands.					
1101 C		20. Gas pump card reader height 56 inches from the ground.					
Bus and Prof. Code	13660(3)	21. No sign stating no refueling for disabled persons.					
SEE PHOTO Nos. 8 thru' 11							
13651(b)(1)		22. This location does not provide public restrooms.					
Bus and Prof. Code	#13651(a)(1)	23. This location charges a fee for customers compressed air and water.					

Bus and Prof Code #13651(2)

24. No sign stating compressed air and water are free to customers.

SEE PHOTO Nos. 12 and 13

THERE ARE NO PUBLIC RESTROOMS AT THIS LOCATION.

#2

#3

#4

#5



#7

#8

#9



#11

#12





JS 44 (Rev. 12/96)

CIVIL COVER SHEET

The JS-44 civil cover sheet and the information contained herein neither replace nor supplement the filing and service of pleadings or other papers as required by law, except as provided by local rules of court. This form, approved by the Judicial Conference of the United States in September 1974, is required for the use of the Clerk of Court for the purpose of initiation the civil docket sheet. (SEE INSTRUCTIONS ON THE REVERSE OF THE CORM), a constant of the civil docket sheet.

of Court for the purpose of ir i. (a) PLAINTIFFS	nitiating the civil docket sh	eet. (SEE INSTRUC	CTIONS	ON THE REVERSE O DEFENDANTS	FTHEEORM 30 PH	1 12: 54
LYNN J HUBBA	RD DRAIGA	J. AUBBARD	ROSHAN L. GUPTA and SHEELA GUPTA dba GAS DEPOT STATION.			
	OF FIRST LISTED PLAINTIFF OF IN U.S. PLAINTIFF C		NOTE: IN LAND COM	3 Y . OF FIRST LISTED DEFENDANT (IN U.S. PLAINTIFF CASE (DEMNATION CASES; USE T		
(C) ATTORNEYS (FIRM NAME	, ADDRESS, AND TELEPHONE	NUMBER)		ATTORNEYS (IF KNOWN		•
	Lynn Hubbard, III, E Lynn Hubbard, 12 V Chico, CA 95926	Villiamsburg Lai		4 CV 259	LAB (PO	OR)
II. BASIS OF JURISDI	CTION (PLACE AN "X"	IN ONE BOX ONLY		CITIZENSHIP OF P (For Diversity Cases Only)	RINCIPAL PARTIES	(PLACE IN "X" IN ONE BOX FOR (IFF AND ONE BOX FOR DEFENDANT)
1 U.S. Government Plaintiff 2 U.S Government Defendant	Federal Question (U.S. Governmen D4 Diversity (Indicate Citizens in Item III)		o o	Citizen of This State Citizen of Another State	of Business i □ 2 □ 2 Incorporated a	nd Principal Place ☐ 5 ☐ 5 n Another State
VI. ORIGIN		(PLACE AN "X	" IN ON	E BOX ONLY)		Appeal to District
✓1 Original □ 2 Representation 2 Representation □		anded from 4	Reinsta Reopen	ited or 5 anoth	ferred from er district6 Multidistr ify)titigation	Judge from ict 7 Magistrate
V. NATURE OF SUIT	(PLACE AN "X" IN ONE I					
CONTRACT 110 Insurance Marine 120 Marine 130 Miller Act 140 Negotiable Insurance 151 Recovery of Overpayment & Enforcement of Judgment 151 Medicare Act 152 Recovery of Defaulted Student Loans (Excl. Veterans) 153 Recovery of Overpayment of Veteran's Benefits 160 Stockholders' Suits 190 Other Contract 195 Contract Product Liability REAL PROPERTY 210 Land Condemnation 220 Foreciosure 230 Rent Lease & Ejectment 240 Torts to Land 245 Tort Product Liability 280 All Other Real Property VI. CAUSE OF ACTIO	PERSONAL INJURY 310 Airplane 315 Airplane Product Liability 320 Assault, Libel & Slander 330 Federal Employers' Liability 340 Marine 345 Marine Product Liability 350 Motor Vehicle 355 Motor Vehicle Product Liability 360 Other Personal Injury CIVIL RIGHTS 441 Voting 442 Employment 443 Housing/ 443 Accommodations 444 Welfare 440 Other Civil Rights N (CITE THE U.S. CIVIL ST.	PRISONER PETIT 510 Motions to Va Sentence HABEAS CORPUS: 530 General 535 Death Penalty 540 Mandamus & 550 Civil Rights 555 Prison Condition	icce y- tity sonal Llability TTY ng al al al al llability Cons Cother on YOU ARE	FORFEITURE/PENALTY \$10	422 Appeal 28 USC 158 423 Withdrawal 28 USC 157 PROPERTY RIGHTS 820 Copyrights 830 Patent 840 Trademark SOCIAL SECURITY 861 HIA (1395ff) 862 Black Lung (923) 864 SSID Title XVI 865 RSI (405(g)) FEDERAL TAX SUITS 870 Taxes (U.S. Plaintiff or Defendant) 871 IRS - Third Party 26 USC 7609	OTHER STATUTES 400
42 U.S.C. Section	DO NOT CITE JURISDIC	uction Standard	sity.) is	DEMAND \$ Excess \$75,00	CHECK YES	Sonly if demanded in complaint:
VIII. RELATED CASE		UDGE			DOCKET NUMBER	
December FOR OFFICE USE ONLY	27, 2004	SIGNATURE OF	OR OR	NET OF RECORD		
DECEMBE 116885	167) 00	ADDI VINO :55		WB65		******

This form was electronically produced by Elite Federal Forms, Inc.

vas electronically produced by Elite F